Research Report: Measurements of emissions to air of particulate matter (PM$_{10}$), nickel and polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAHs) at three UK oil refineries

1st edition
The Energy Institute (EI) is the leading chartered professional membership body supporting individuals and organisations across the energy industry. With a combined membership of over 14,000 individuals and 300 companies in 100 countries, it provides an independent focal point for the energy community and a powerful voice to engage business and industry, government, academia and the public internationally.

As a Royal Charter organisation, the EI offers professional recognition and sustains personal career development through the accreditation and delivery of training courses, conferences and publications and networking opportunities. It also runs a highly valued technical work programme, comprising original independent research and investigations, and the provision of EI technical publications to provide the international industry with information and guidance on key current and future issues.

The EI promotes the safe, environmentally responsible and efficient supply and use of energy in all its forms and applications. In fulfilling this purpose the EI addresses the depth and breadth of energy and the energy system, from upstream and downstream hydrocarbons and other primary fuels and renewables, to power generation, transmission and distribution to sustainable development, demand side management and energy efficiency. Offering learning and networking opportunities to support career development, the EI provides a home to all those working in energy, and a scientific and technical reservoir of knowledge for industry.

This publication has been produced as a result of work carried out within the Technical Team of the EI, funded by the EI’s Technical Partners. The EI’s Technical Work Programme provides industry with cost-effective, value-adding knowledge on key current and future issues affecting those operating in the energy sector, both in the UK and internationally.

For further information, please visit http://www.energyinst.org

The EI gratefully acknowledges the financial contributions towards the scientific and technical programme from the following companies:

BG Group
BP Exploration Operating Co Ltd
BP Oil UK Ltd
Centrica
Chevron
ConocoPhillips Ltd
EDF Energy
ENI
E. ON UK
ExxonMobil International Ltd
International Power
Kuwait Petroleum International Ltd
Maersk Oil North Sea UK Limited
Murco Petroleum Ltd

Nexen
Phillips 66
Premier Oil
RWE npower
Saudi Aramco
Shell UK Oil Products Limited
Shell U.K. Exploration and Production Ltd
SSE
Statoil
Talisman Energy (UK) Ltd
Total E&P UK plc
Total UK Limited
Valero
World Fuel Services

However, it should be noted that the above organisations have not all been directly involved in the development of this publication, nor do they necessarily endorse its content.

Copyright © 2012 by the Energy Institute, London.
The Energy Institute is a professional membership body incorporated by Royal Charter 2003.
Registered charity number 1097899, England
All rights reserved

No part of this book may be reproduced by any means, or transmitted or translated into a machine language without the written permission of the publisher.

ISBN 0 85293 633 7

Published by the Energy Institute

The information contained in this publication is provided for general information purposes only. Whilst the Energy Institute and the contributors have applied reasonable care in developing this publication, no representations or warranties, express or implied, are made by the Energy Institute or any of the contributors concerning the applicability, suitability, accuracy or completeness of the information contained herein and the Energy Institute and the contributors accept no responsibility whatsoever for the use of this information. Neither the Energy Institute nor any of the contributors shall be liable in any way for any liability, loss, cost or damage incurred as a result of the receipt or use of the information contained herein.

Further copies can be obtained from: Portland Customer Services, Commerce Way, Whitehall Industrial Estate, Colchester CO2 8HP, UK.
t: +44 (0)1206 796 351 e: sales@portland-services.com

Electronic access to EI and IP publications is available via our website, www.energypublishing.org
Documents can be purchased online as downloadable pdfs or on an annual subscription for single users and companies.
For more information, contact the EI Publications Team.
e: pubs@energyinst.org
CONTENTS

Foreword .......................................................... 5
Acknowledgements .................................................. 6

1 Introduction .................................................... 7

2 Particulate matter (PM_{10}) .................................... 9
  2.1 Sectoral contributions ........................................ 9
  2.2 Emissions from combustion units ............................. 10
    2.2.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 10
    2.2.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 11
  2.3 Emissions from FCCU regenerators .......................... 12
    2.3.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 13
    2.3.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 13

3 Nickel .......................................................... 15
  3.1 Sectoral contributions ........................................ 15
  3.2 Emissions from combustion units ............................. 16
    3.2.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 16
    3.2.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 17
  3.3 Emissions from FCCU regenerators .......................... 18
    3.3.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 18
    3.3.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 18

4 Polycyclic Aromatic Hydrocarbons ............................. 20
  4.1 Sectoral contributions ........................................ 20
  4.2 Emissions from combustion units ............................. 21
    4.2.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 21
    4.2.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 22
  4.3 Emissions from FCCU regenerators .......................... 24
    4.3.1 Stack monitoring data .................................. 24
    4.3.2 Emission estimates ..................................... 25

5 Discussion ...................................................... 27

6 References ..................................................... 29

Appendices:

Appendix 1 Monitoring reference methods .......................... 30
Appendix 2 Refinery A: Results from PM_{10} measurements on combustion unit stack .......... 31
Appendix 3 Refinery B: Results from PM_{10} measurements on combustion unit stack ........... 32
Appendix 4 Refinery B: Results from PM_{10} measurements on FCCU stack ...................... 33
Appendix 5 Refinery C: Results from PM_{10} measurements on FCCU stack ...................... 34
Appendix 6 Refineries A and B: Results from total nickel measurements on combustion unit stacks 35
Appendix 7 Refinery C: Results from total nickel measurements on FCCU stack ................. 36
Appendix 8 Refinery A: Results from PAH measurements on combustion unit stack ............ 37
Appendix 9 Refinery B: Results from B[a]P particulate measurements on combustion unit stack 38
Appendix 10 Sample analysis list of PAHs ........................................... 39
Appendix 11 Refinery C: Results from total PAH measurements on FCCU stack .................. 40
FOREWORD

Measurements of the concentration of PM$_{10}$, nickel (total and in particulate phase), total PAHs and B[a]P have been made in stacks at three UK refineries. Measurements were made on two dual-fired combustion units and on two FCCU regenerators. These data were used to calculate the mass emissions of these pollutants.

All of the measured concentrations of PAH and B[a]P, for both combustion units and FCCUs, were below the limit of detection of the analytical equipment used.

For each pollutant a review of the contribution of the oil refining sector contribution to the UK national air emissions inventory for 2010 has been undertaken. Refineries provide minor contributions of both PM$_{10}$ and PAHs: 1.0 % and 0.9 % respectively. Combustion of residual fuel oils in refineries, however, results in their nickel emissions being relatively significant in the overall inventory compared to other heavy metals. Oil refining contributed 7.4 % of the national atmospheric nickel inventory in 2010.

From information supplied by the refineries on the properties and quantities of fuels fired and on operating data from the FCCUs, the mass emissions have been estimated for each campaign measurement run. These estimates have been made using the methodologies provided in the UKPIA protocol published by the Environment Agency in its Petroleum Activities Guidance Note on pollution inventory reporting. This protocol is used by UK refineries in developing their inventory submissions. In addition, for comparison, other emission estimation factors published in internationally recognised guidance documents have been used.

The project has shown, assuming the limited measurements are representative, that the oil industry is over-estimating its emissions of PM$_{10}$ from both combustion and FCCUs and also nickel emissions from FCCUs. It is probably also over-estimating PAH emissions as all of the measurements were reported to be below the limit of detection values. Where the industry may be under-estimating is the quantity of nickel emitted from fuel oil firing. Recommendations have been proposed to improve the accuracy of the refinery submissions to the UK inventories.
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Report was commissioned by the Energy Institute’s (EI’s) Emissions Working Group. Measurements and calculations as well as editing of the data were carried out by Richard Harvey and Glyn Harrison (RPS Consultants Ltd.).

The Energy Institute wishes to express its gratitude to Brian Smithers who completed the final interpretive summary report covering all three test refineries.

The following members of the Energy Institute’s Emissions Working Group have been associated with the production of this report:

Steve Cross  Shell  
Beate Hildenbrand  Energy Institute  
Kevin Lenthall  Total  
Graham Neal  ExxonMobil  
Paul Shawcross  ConocoPhillips  
Brian Smithers  Consultant  

The Energy Institute records its appreciation of the valuable contributions of the Emissions Working Group members.
1 INTRODUCTION

In 2004, at the request of the Environment Agency (EA), boundary-fence monitoring of benzo[a]pyrene (B[a]P) was undertaken at two UK refineries\(^1\). That project concluded that there were no significant differences between the concentrations measured upwind and downwind of the refineries. Furthermore the average B[a]P concentrations were relatively low, being comparable to those expected at urban sampling locations within the UK polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons (PAH) monitoring network.

During the PPC permitting discussions in 2007, it was agreed with the EA to undertake stack measurements at three refineries to permit a further assessment of the emissions of PAHs. B[a]P was chosen to be the focus of this campaign as this compound is used as a surrogate for total PAHs in ambient air quality monitoring. For the latter, B[a]P is measured in the PM\(_{10}\) fraction of the particulate phase. This contains the great majority of the emissions, the concentrations in the vapour phase being significantly lower due to the low volatility of B[a]P. To obtain a full understanding of the emissions, however, the scope of the measurement campaigns was widened to include a limited number of measurements of total PAHs.

In addition the EA requested an assessment of emissions of a heavy metal. Nickel was selected to be measured as refineries are one of the major industrial emission sources of this pollutant due to the combustion of heavy fuel oil. Again the focus was on the particulate phase (PM\(_{10}\) fraction), although limited measurements of total (both particulate and gas phase) nickel emissions were included in the measurement campaigns.

As particulate sampling is a necessity to determine the concentrations of both nickel and B[a]P in their solid phases, the project was extended to report and assess the measured concentrations of the PM\(_{10}\) fraction of the particulate emissions.

The main sources of refinery emissions of PAHs and nickel are from fuel oil combustion and from FCCU regenerators. Due to the constraints of the Large Combustion Plant Directive\(^2\) the sole firing of fuel oil is now very rarely practised in UK refineries. Measurements were made, therefore, on dual-fired combustion units in which refinery fuel gas and fuel oil are burnt simultaneously.

Monitoring campaigns were undertaken between September 2009 and February 2010. Concentration measurements of the following pollutants were made:

From dual-fired combustion units:
- Refinery A – PM\(_{10}\), Ni and B[a]P in PM\(_{10}\) fraction, total Ni and total PAHs.
- Refinery B – PM\(_{10}\), Ni and B[a]P in PM\(_{10}\) fraction, total Ni.

From FCCU regenerators:
- Refinery B – PM\(_{10}\), Ni and B[a]P in PM\(_{10}\) fraction.
- Refinery C – PM\(_{10}\), Ni and B[a]P in PM\(_{10}\) fraction, total Ni and total PAHs.

Stack monitoring was carried out by accredited consultants (RPS Consultants Ltd) in accordance with documented procedures and using the reference methods listed in Appendix 1. The sample analyses were undertaken at UKAS accredited laboratories; the majority at RPS Laboratories (Manchester), with the PAH analyses carried out at Marchwood Scientific Services Ltd. Stack gas flow rates were also determined allowing mass emission fluxes to be calculated over the monitoring periods.

The operating conditions of the combustion units and FCCUs during the period of the surveys were provided by the refineries. These permit the emissions to be estimated using
This publication has been produced as a result of work carried out within the Technical Team of the Energy Institute (EI), funded by the EI’s Technical Partners. The EI’s Technical Work Programme provides industry with cost effective, value adding knowledge on key current and future issues affecting those operating in the energy sector, both in the UK and beyond.